Exhibit A

King-Devick Test, Inc., v. NYU Langone Hospitals, et al.

Alan King

Page 1

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT

FOR THE

SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

KING-DEVICK TEST, INC.,
Plaintiff,

V. Civil No:1:17-cv-09307

NYU LANGONE HOSPITALS, NEW YORK UNIVERSITY, STEVEN L. GALETTA, and LAURA J. BALCER,

Defendant.

VIDEOTAPED DEPOSITION

OF

DR. ALAN KING

October 19, 2018

1:47 p.m.

LOCATION: Radisson Hotel Bismarck

Empire Conference Room

605 East Broadway Avenue

Bismarck, North Dakota 58501

REPORTER: KAYLA A. RICHMOND

DIGITAL EVIDENCE GROUP

1730 M Street, NW, Suite 812

Washington, D.C. 20036

(202) 232-0646

King-Devick Test, Inc., v. NYU Langone Hospitals, et al.

1	A. Yes.	1	functions where your eyes jump from one spot to another.
2	Q. What type of research did you do?	2	Q. So how is that different from the continuous
3	A. Well, most of the research we did was when Steve	3	pursuit?
4	and I decided to develop the King-Devick Test.	4	A. Well, you don't use continuous pursuit in
5	Q. When did you start that research?	5	reading you that's that's something that you like
6	A. I don't recall.	6	following a baseball. But if you're reading, you're
7	Q. Was this research for a class?	7	using saccadic fixations.
8	A. It was for our senior research project.	8	Q. Where did you first learn about saccadic
9	Q. What's a senior research project?	9	fixations?
10	A. Everybody who graduates from optometry school	10	A. In class.
11	has to do a doctoral thesis and it's called a senior	11	Q. And what did you learn in class?
12	research project. And so Steven and I decided to	12	A. There was a test called the Pierce Saccade Test
13	corroborate on this test.	13	that we that was being taught at the school.
14	Q. Is it is it something that you have to do	14	Q. What is a saccade?
15	field research or is it writing a paper?	15	A. I just told you. Saccade is going from one spot
16	A. Both.	16	to another.
17	Q. And who decided to work with the other? Did you	17	Q. So is a saccades the same as a saccadic
18	decide to work with Mr. Devick or did he approach you to	18	fixation?
19	work with him on this research?	19	A. Yes.
20	MR. KLUFT: Object to the form. You can	20	Q. Before you started your research project, did
21	answer.	21	you research other eye movement exams?
22	A. I have no idea. I don't really remember. It was	22	A. Do not recall.
	D 14		D 16
	Page 14		Page 16
1	42 years ago.	1	Q. Did you review the literature in that area of
2	Q. Was there a professor that advises you for your	2	research?
3	senior research project?	3	A. Yes.
4	A. Yes.	4	Q. Do you recall what what books or papers that
5	Q. Who was that professor?	5	you reviewed?
6	A. Dr. Darrell Slangy.	6	A. I don't recall.
7	Q. And was he your professor for any other classes?	7	Q. You mentioned the Pierce Saccade Test, what is
8	A. Yes.	8	the Pierce Saccade Test?
9	Q. What classes?	9	A. It was a a paper produced by a professor of
10	A. No recollection.	10	optometry and not sure where he was that he developed
11	Q. Did everyone in your class do a senior research	11	the Pierce Saccade Test which he thought tested saccadic
12	project in a pair?	12	functions.
13	A. No.	13	Q. And why do you say he thought?
14	Q. Can you just tell me generally what your	14	A. Because he was wrong.
15	research, the senior research paper was about?	15	Q. Why was he wrong?
16	A. Detecting reading disabilities by testing	16	A. He didn't how do I go about this explaining
17	saccadic functions of the eye.	17	it. His test was designed so you just go from one point
18	Q. What is a saccadic function?	18	to another, it didn't really test the saccadic function.
19	A. It's the eye movements that you use when you	19	It actually tested pursuits more than it did that. So it
20	when you go from when you're reading a line of paper,	20	didn't mimic the reading process.
21	your eyes go in saccadic fixations, not continual	21	Q. So to mimic the reading process, would you need
22	pursuits, but they go in saccadic, sporadic saccadic	22	to be looking at more than two items on a line?
	, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,		
	Page 15		Page 17

King-Devick Test, Inc., v. NYU Langone Hospitals, et al.

Alan King 1 A. Yes. 1 with a vision test called the Gilbert Test? 2 2 Q. Do you recall when you first learned about the A. No. 3 3 Pierce Saccade Test? Q. Are you familiar with an optometrist named 4 Luther Gilbert? A. I don't remember. 5 Q. Do you recall if you learned about it in class? A. No. 6 6 MR. KLUFT: Objection. Asked and Q. When you were working on your research, your 7 7 answered. You can answer. senior research project with Mr. Devick, were there any 8 8 A. I believe it was in class, yes. other tests that involved reading numbers or letters 9 9 Q. Do you recall who the professor was? that you studied? 10 10 A. No. A. No. 11 11 Q. So after you studied the Pierce Saccade Test, Q. Were there any similar saccadic tests that you 12 12 studied in class? what did you do next for your research study? 13 13 A. Not that I know of. MR. KLUFT: Object to the form. I think it 14 Q. Are you familiar with a test called the Vincett 14 mischaracterizes testimony, but you can answer. 15 1.5 Test? A. I'm not sure what you're asking. 16 Q. Sure. I'll rephrase the question. Well, describe 16 A. No. 17 Q. Dr. King, I'm handing you what's marked as 17 for me what the beginning steps were of your senior 18 18 exhibit two. And this has on the bottom right, a bates research project with Mr. Devick? 19 19 number. This is just an identifier that shows, you know, A. When we looked at the Pierce Saccade Test, we 20 20 what number this document is. This is - this document decided it didn't really test saccadic functions and it 21 21 has bates number NYU00469222. So just take a look at didn't mimic the reading process and our whole -- our 22 22 this document and obviously it's -- it's got multiple whole basis of research was to try to be able to Page 18 Page 20 identify reading difficulties in children, so we decided pages, but I can tell you which -- which pages we're 2 2 going to be focusing on, but just take a look and let me to design something that would more accurately test 3 3 know if you've seen this before? reading ability in children rather than what was on the 4 Pierce Saccade Test because it didn't predict any -- it A. I do not recall seeing this before. 5 5 Q. So I'll represent that this is a photocopy of a didn't mimic the reading process at all. 6 6 publicly available book by William K. Vincett. If you O. And what's the -- what is the connection between 7 can turn, please, to the page number at the bottom that 7 your reading ability and the saccadic function? 8 8 ends with four six, nine, two, three, seven? A. In order to be a good reader, if you're -- you 9 A. Yeah. have to have accurate saccades, if you don't have 10 10 Q. Take a look at the pages that are marked page 33 accurate saccades, a lot of times, just for an example, 11 11 and 34 at the bottom. That's actually the page that you when you're taking our test, you might overshoot a 12 12 number and then have to come back because you -- the were on. 13 1.3 A. Pardon me? saccadic fixation wasn't accurate, so it takes somebody 14 14 MR. KLUFT: And by 33 and 34, just for the with poor saccadic functions longer to read our pages 15 record, you don't mean the bates numbers, but the 15 than someone who has accurate saccadic functions. 16 16 records of the articles. Q. So somebody who has inaccurate saccadic function 17 17 Q. Yeah, no. The number at the center in the would take longer to read a page than somebody who did 18 18 bottom, so the two pages that you have. have accurate saccadic function? 19 19 A. These two? A. Yes. 20 20 Q. Yes. Have you seen these before? Q. Dr. King, I'm gonna hand you what's marked as 21 21 exhibit three and this has the bates number KDT zero, A. No. 22 22 Q. Okay. You can set that aside. Are you familiar two, nine, eight, three, zero, four and the -- this is

Page 19

King-Devick Test, Inc., v. NYU Langone Hospitals, et al.

		1	
1	A. Similar.	1	Q. What else is similar?
2	Q. How is it similar?	2	A. The lines and then no lines.
3	A. They have the arrows and lines.	3	Q. When you say the lines, do you mean the lines on
4	Q. And what are the arrows and lines for?	4	the demonstration card?
5	A. Again, to show whoever is taking the test how to	5	A. Yes.
6	follow.	6	Q. And on the test one card?
7	Q. And then flipping to the next page, ending in	7	A. Yes.
8	bates number eight, three, three, one, what are the	8	Q. And when you say no lines, do you mean on test
9	lines on this page for?	9	two and test three cards?
10	MR. KLUFT: Objection. Lack of foundation,	10	A. Yes.
11	you can answer.	11	Q. Is there anything else that's similar between
12	A. The same way just to follow to go from one	12	the two tests?
13	number to the next.	13	A. No.
14	Q. Then flipping to the next page ending with	14	Q. What's different between the King-Devick Test
15	eight, three, three, two. Are there any lines on this	15	and the Pierce Saccade Test?
16	page?	16	MR. KLUFT: Objection. You can answer.
17	A. No.	17	A. Because of the fact that we used more numbers,
18	Q. Do you know why not?	18	more randomly spaced numbers, it actually tested
19	A. No.	19	saccadic function. Whereas this did not because it just,
20	Q. On this page would the reader read the numbers	20	it was just smooth pursuits and habituation. There were
21	from left to right?	21	a lot of things wrong with this that didn't test
22	MR. KLUFT: Objection. You can answer.	22	saccadic function.
	Page 34		Page 36
	Tage 34		
1	A. Yes.	1	Q. Did you refer to the Pierce Saccade Test when
2	Q. Flipping to the next page ending in two, nine,	2	you were developing the King-Devick Test?
3	eight, three, three, three. Would the reader read the	3	MR. KLUFT: Objection. Vague.
4	numbers from left to right on this page as well?	4	A. I think they gave it to us. I don't remember.
5	A. Yes.	5	Q. Did you study the Pierce Saccade Test in your
6	Q. Is the King-Devick Test a modification of the	6	classes before you began developing the King-Devick
7	Pierce Saccade Test?	7	Test?
8	A. No.	8	A. Yes.
9	Q. Why do you say that?	9	Q. So flipping back to the page demonstration card
10	A. Because the Pierce Saccade Test did not test	10	with the bates number ending in eight, three, three,
11	saccades.	11	zero?
12	MR. KLUFT: I'm sorry, I'm just gonna	12	A. Yes.
13	object to the form of the question as vague, but you	13	Q. Do you see on the bottom left of the page where
14	already answered.	14	it says Pierce Saccade Test Copyright 1972?
15	Q. Does the King-Devick Test follow the same basic	15	A. I see that.
16	format as the Pierce Saccade Test?	16	Q. And you see at the bottom right of that page
17	MR. KLUFT: Object to the form. You can	17	where it says Cook Inc, PO Box four, nine eight in
18	answer.	18	Indiana, four seven, four, zero, one?
19	A. Basic format, possibly.	19	A. Yes.
20	Q. How does it follow the same basic format?	20	Q. Do you see do you see similar references to
21	A. Well, we have a demonstration card and we have	21	the Pierce Saccade Test copyright and the Cook Inc
22	three tests to test the candidate.	22	address on the next three page ending in eight, three,
	Page 35		Page 37

King-Devick Test, Inc., v. NYU Langone Hospitals, et al.

-		1	
1	three, one, eight, three, three, two, and eight, three,	1 2	Q. Did you know Dr. Pierce personally?
2	three, three?		A. No.
3	A. Yes.	3 4	Q. Did you ever meet Dr. Pierce?
4	Q. Did you ever discuss with anyone whether you		A. Yes.
5	would need to get permission to use the Pierce Saccade	5	Q. When did you meet him?
6	Test in your research?	6	A. I met him right after I graduated, I believe.
7	A. No.	7	One time.
8	Q. Why not?	8	Q. Where did you meet him?
9	A. I have no idea. Because it wasn't the same test.	9	A. At a meeting in Minneapolis.
10	Q. Did you ever try to contact Cook Inc. At this	10	Q. Do you recall what meeting that was?
11	address on the Pierce Saccade Test?	11	A. North Central Conference.
12	A. Nope.	12	Q. What's the North Central Conference?
13	Q. Did Mr. Devick try to contact Cook Inc., at that	13	A. It was just a conference a regional
14	address?	14	conference with several states education.
15	A. I have no idea.	15	Q. And how did you meet him at that conference?
16	Q. Did you ever consider getting a license to use	16	A. Just by chance meeting.
17	the Pierce Saccade Test in your paper?	17	Q. What did what did the two of discuss?
18	MR. KLUFT: Objection. Lack of foundation.	18	A. Nothing. He asked me if I was the King from the
19	A. Don't recall.	19	King-Devick. I said yes.
20	Q. How did you get this copy of the Pierce Saccade	20	Q. Did you talk about the King-Devick Test with Mr.
21	Test?	21	Pierce?
22	A. I don't remember. I don't remember.	22	A. The only thing he said to me was, I wish I had
	Page 38		Page 40
1	Q. Did you have this copy of or a copy of the	1	thought of that. And that was the end of the
2	Pierce Saccade Test when you were developing the	2	conversation.
3	King-Devick Test?	3	Q. Did you respond when he said he wished he had
4	A. Yes.	4	thought of that?
5	Q. Did you refer to that copy of the Pierce Saccade	5	A. No.
6	Test while you were developing the King-Devick Test?	6	Q. Did you know Mr. Pierce before you developed the
7	MR. KLUFT: Objection. Asked and answered.	7	King-Devick Test?
8	You can answer.	8	A. No.
9	A. Not really. We developed our own.	9	Q. Do you know Mr. Pierce came to know about the
10	Q. You had mentioned earlier that there were	10	King-Devick Test?
11	different drafts or versions of the King-Devick Test	11	A. I do not.
12	while you were working on the senior research. Is that	12	Q. Did you ask him?
13	right?	13	A. No.
14	A. Yes.	14	Q. So if you can please turn to page in the same
15	Q. Were there any drafts that had fewer than five	15	exhibit ending in bates number two, nine, eight, three
16	numbers on a row?	16	zero, six? So the very beginning?
17	A. I do not remember.	17	A. Yes.
18	Q. Do you know who created the Pierce Saccade Test?	18	Q. See in the second full paragraph where it says
19	A. Dr. Jack Pierce.	19	with this in mind, we designed a test which was a
20	Q. Who's Dr. Jack Pierce?	20	modification of the Pierce and Vincett test, which we
21	A. He's a professor of optometry that taught at	21	administered to 137 school aged children in the Chicago
22	some of the schools. I'm not even sure where he was.	22	area. Do you see where it says that?
	Page 39		Page 41

King-Devick Test, Inc., v. NYU Langone Hospitals, et al.

		1	
1	A. I have no idea.	1	paper, did you look at any other any prior senior
2	Q. When you submitted your senior paper, did you	2	papers from other students?
3	expect that your senior advisor would give it back to	3	A. No.
4	you?	4	Q. After you submitted your senior paper, did you
5	A. Yes.	5	have to present your research in class?
6	Q. And he did give it back to you?	6	A. I don't recall.
7	A. Yes.	7	Q. Do you recall whether there was any other work
8	Q. Did you expect that the college's library would	8	product other than the paper itself that came out of
9	receive a copy?	9	your research?
10	A. No.	10	A. I don't understand your question.
11	Q. Do you know whether the library did receive a	11	Q. Were there any other physical materials, any
12	copy?	12	other presentations that you created based on your
13	A. I believe they did. I'm not sure.	13	senior research?
14	Q. Do you know who provided that copy to the	14	A. No.
15	library?	15	Q. Did you give any presentations about the
16	MR. KLUFT: Objection.	16	King-Devick test to anyone, whether they were at the
17	A. No. I don't.	17	college or not?
18	Q. Do you know whether the library made any copies	18	MR. KLUFT: Objection. Vague as to time
19	of the senior paper that it had?	19	period.
20	A. I do not know.	20	A. Exactly. I don't know when.
21	Q. Do you know who had access to the copies to the	21	Q. Did you give any presentations about the
22	senior paper at the Illinois College of Optometry	22	King-Devick Test to anyone in the 1970s?
	Page 58		Page 60
1	library?	1	A. No. Not that I remember.
2	MR. KLUFT: Objection. There's almost no	2	Q. When did you start your optometry practice?
3	foundation for any of these questions. So my continuing	3	A. 1976.
4	objection, but you can answer if you know.	4	Q. Did you use the test as part of your optometry
5	A. No.	5	practice?
6	Q. Do you know how other researchers who were	6	A. Yes.
7	interested in vision tests would be able to get a copy	7	Q. Do you recall when you started using the
8	of the senior paper?	8	King-Devick Test?
9	MR. KLUFT: Objection.	9	A. Right away.
10	A. I do not know how.	10	Q. Do you recall around what month that would have
11	Q. Do you know whether any researchers learned	11	been?
12	about the King-Devick Test in the 1970s?	12	A. June.
13	MR. KLUFT: Objection. Vague. You can	13	Q. June of 1976? How did you use the King-Devick
14	answer.	14	Test in your optometry practice?
15	A. Nope.	15	A. I made copies of the cards and I used them to
16	Q. Are you aware of any research articles published	16	test students who I thought might be poor readers
17	in the 1970s that referenced the King-Devick Test?	17	patients that I thought might be poor readers.
18	A. I do not.	18	Q. Do you recall how many copies you made of the
19	Q. Do you know whether the Illinois College of	19	test when you first started your optometry practice?
20	Optometry's library kept copies of senior papers?	20	MR. KLUFT: Objection. Vague as to time
21	A. I don't know for sure.	21	period, but go ahead.
22	Q. When you were doing research for this senior	22	A. One.
	Z. Then you were doing research for this semol		0110.
	Page 59		Page 61

King-Devick Test, Inc., v. NYU Langone Hospitals, et al.

Alan King 1 1 Q. Before 1980, did you work with any other Q. When you tested your patients with the 2 2 King-Devick Test, did you test any other vision tests? optometrists in your optometry practice? 3 3 A. No. Q. Did you give out any copies of the King-Devick Q. You were a solo practitioner? 5 test to any of your patients? 5 A. Correct. 6 6 Q. Did you ever work with Mr. Devick in an MR. KLUFT: Objection. Vague as to time 7 7 period. optometry practice? 8 8 A. No. A. Not really. 9 Q. Why do you say not really? 9 Q. Before 1980 was your optometry practice based in 10 10 A. I used a couple maybe over -- before Bernell, I Dickinson, North Dakota? 11 11 think I might've made a copy to give to a student, maybe A. No, I was in Langdon, North Dakota. 12 12 two or three times. Q. And where is Langdon, North Dakota? 13 13 A. Northeast corner of the state. Q. Do you recall whether that was before 1980? 14 14 A. It would have definitely been before 1980. Q. When you gave that copy of the King-Devick Test 15 1.5 Q. And who was the student that you made copies to one of your patients, did you ask for it back? 16 16 A. I believe I did. for. 17 A. I have no idea. 17 Q. Do you recall whether this patient gave you the 18 Q. Was this a student at the Illinois College of 18 test back? 19 19 Optometry? A. I believe they did. 20 20 A. No. These were patients when I was in practice. Q. Do you recall around when you asked for the test 21 21 Q. So you -- you made a copy of the King-Devick back? 22 Test for a patient at your practice? 22 A. No. Page 62 Page 64 A. Yes. Q. Do you know whether the patient made any copies 2 2 Q. Do you recall -- do you recall why? of the King-Devick Test? 3 A. I used that as remediation for a couple of my A. No. 4 Q. You don't recall? patients. 5 5 Q. What do you mean by remediation? A. I don't know. 6 A. I had them use the test over and over again and Q. Do you -- do you know whether he showed anyone 7 I felt that by using the test over and over again, it 7 his copy or her copy of the King-Devick Test? 8 8 would improve their saccadic functions. A. I have no idea. 9 9 Q. Did it improve their function? Q. Are you aware of any colleges or universities 10 10 A. Yep. that taught the King-Devick Test prior to 1980? 11 11 MR. KLUFT: Objection. Vague. You can MR. KLUFT: I'm sorry. I just -- I just 12 12 would impose an objection. I just want to caution that answer. 13 we don't want to get too far into medical histories of 13 A. I have no idea. 14 14 individual -- individual patients. And if we do, I want Q. Just going back to the patient who received a 15 to take a break and think about the question. So if 15 copy of the King-Devick Test before 1980, do you recall 16 16 this person's name? you're going to stop it there, that's fine. But if we're 17 17 going to get deep into somebody's medical history, I MR. KLUFT: Objection. You can answer. I'm 18 18 want to think about it and maybe have a discussion off sorry. I withdraw the objection. I just -- instead, I 19 19 just want to caution, again, I don't want to get into 20 20 Q. Sure. Did you give any copies of the King-Devick medical history. If we are going to get into it, I'd 21 21 like to maybe designate a portion of the transcript as Test to any parents of your patients? 22 22 A. No. highly confidential and --

Page 63